

Plaintiff provides extensive objections to one specific exhibit, Defendants DX7392:

Plaintiff objects to the authenticity of Defendants' Exhibit 7392. A document may be authenticated by "appearance, contents, substance, internal patterns, or other distinctive characteristics, taken in conjunction with circumstances." Fed. R. Evid. 901(b)(4). A district court has discretion to determine authenticity, *United States v. Siddiqui*, 235 F.3d at 1322. The document in question lacks any markings from the FDA and does not even come from the email account of Dr. Dobbs which is listed on the Health and Human Services Website as "donald.dobbs@fda.hhs.gov." Furthermore, Dr. Dobb's mailing address and phone numbers are not provided at the bottom of the email as is customary for other emails from the FDA. As such, it is unclear who at the FDA, if anyone, actually sent the email in question. This is most troubling considering that Defendants are attempting to use this email as representing the official position of the FDA. When asked about the email at his deposition in December 2008, Dr. Ruggieri stated:

Q. Did you receive this e-mail through your home computer?

A. Yes.

Q. Do you still have the e-mail on your home computer?

A. I don't think I do. (Deposition of Alex Ruggieri, December 5, 2008, pp. 277-278)

Dr. Ruggieri has never produced the e-mail with routing information which could settle the question of its authenticity. Defendants have been well aware of Plaintiff's questions concerning the authenticity of this document, yet have failed to do anything. For example, they could have obtained a "red ribboned" version of the email from the FDA to validate its authenticity.

Hearsay

Aside from its authenticity, the document is inadmissible hearsay. The document purports to set forth the FDA's position regarding the usage of adverse event reports in the context of suicidality. According to the e-mail, Dr. Dobbs allegedly provides the position of the FDA. It is unclear that Dr. Dobbs is authorized to provide official policy determinations of the FDA. Since Defendants are putting forth this email to prove that the FDA does not believe that adverse events can be used to determine causality, the document is classic hearsay. The email does not fall under any of the hearsay exceptions as it does not satisfy the requirements of F.R.E. 803(6) or 803(8). It is therefore inadmissible hearsay and not relevant to any issue herein, especially the FDA's position on whether information in the AER's can cause increased suicidal thoughts or behavior in patients taking antiepileptic drugs.

Prejudice outweighs probative value.

These documents have been provided to the Court.

The following table lists Plaintiffs' remaining document objections not listed above, with the exception of authenticity objections which also have substantive objections. Copies of each exhibit will be provided to the court.

There are certain broad categories of documents that are likely to be addressed as a group:

1. C.V.'s of various witnesses: DX0219, DX0221, DX0227, DX0229, DX0247, DX7436, DX7449, DX7450, DX7453, and DX7461
2. Declaration and affidavits: DX7411, DX7413, DX7454-DX7460
3. Charts used in the preservation deposition of Defendants' expert Dr. Charles Taylor: DX7566-DX7559
4. CFR's and one Federal Register citation: DX7768-DX7780
5. Transcripts: DX7781-DX7783 and DX7462

Exhibit Number	Description	Objection	Comment
DX0213	Gary Wayne Biggs Notes	Hearsay; Unfairly Prejudicial- Prejudice Outweighs Probative Value; Relevance	
DX0214	Gary Wayne Biggs Investigation Fee Schedule	Hearsay; Unfairly Prejudicial- Prejudice Outweighs Probative Value; Relevance	
DX0219	C.V. - Curriculum Vitae of James Cato, M.D.	Hearsay; Unfairly Prejudicial- Prejudice Outweighs Probative Value	
DX0221	C.V. - Curriculum Vitae of Carl Hampf, M.D.	Hearsay; Unfairly Prejudicial- Prejudice Outweighs Probative Value	
DX0227	C.V. - Curriculum Vitae of Feng Li, M.D., J.D., Ph.D.	Hearsay; Unfairly Prejudicial- Prejudice Outweighs Probative Value	
DX0229	C.V. - Curriculum Vitae of Edward Mackey, M.D.	Hearsay; Unfairly Prejudicial- Prejudice Outweighs Probative Value	
DX0247	C.V. - Curriculum Vitae of Stewart Stowers.	Hearsay; Unfairly Prejudicial- Prejudice Outweighs Probative Value	
DX0265	Medical Chronology of Richard Smith	Authenticity; Hearsay; Unfairly Prejudicial- Prejudice Outweighs Probative Value; Fails To Meet The Requirements of FRE 702 And/Or FRE 703	Document is a medical chronology prepared by Defendants' counsel
DX7045	Neurontin Indication Status Spreadsheets bearing the bates range Pfizer_MDL_0008198 - 408.	Relevance	Shows approval history outside the United States. Foreign approvals not relevant to Smith Case.
DX7051	NDA Narratives in Epilepsy NDA.	Authenticity; Defendant Document Lacks Bates Number And Was Not Produced In Accordance With Rule 26 Or Plaintiff Discovery Demand	
DX7212	Plaintiff Lawyer Ads.	Authenticity; Relevance; Unfairly Prejudicial- Prejudice Outweighs Probative Value	

Exhibit Number	Description	Objection	Comment
DX7255	FDA Advisory Committee meeting slide presentation by Dr. J Cramer.	Hearsay	
DX7288	Brock's handwritten notes.	Relevance; Hearsay	
DX7295	International Conference On Harmonisation Of Technical Requirements For Registration Of Pharmaceuticals For Human Use; ICH Harmonised Tripartite Guideline: Guideline For Good Clinical Practice (E6(R1)).	Exhibit Does Not Match Description	
DX7305	Bipolar and Gabapentin Sensitivity Analysis.	Hearsay; Fails To Meet The Requirements of FRE 702 And/Or FRE 703	Charts from analyses of Defense Expert Robert Gibbons
DX7374	FDA Talk Paper on Antidepressants.	Relevance	Has nothing to do with Neurontin or other AED's
DX7375	Statement from American Epilepsy Society.	Hearsay; Unfairly Prejudicial- Prejudice Outweighs Probative Value	
DX7379	An Update on the Possible Mechanisms of Action of Gabapentin. By: Charles Taylor bearing the bates range Pfizer_CTaylor_0008905 - 23.	Rule 403;	
DX7382	Report by Dr. Stephen Brown, "Gabapentin and Psychosis" bearing the bates range MDL_LABL_0000002 - 04.	Hearsay	Objection is to the attached report.
DX7383	Report from Dr. Stephen Brown to Dr. Tim Paget bearing the bates range Pfizer_CPacella_0009440 - 49.	Hearsay	
DX7384	Medicines Control Agency Draft Response bearing the bates range Pfizer_LKnapp_0135264 - 65.	Hearsay	Document is a draft and not a final document, therefore no hearsay exception applies.
DX7391	Email from Dr. Alexander Ruggieri to Dr. Steven Galson.	Hearsay	
DX7392	Email from Donald Dobbs to Dr. Alexander Ruggieri.	Authenticity; Hearsay	Please See extensive comments in the authenticity section
DX7401	Pharmacist's Letter/Prescriber's Letter bearing the bates range Pfizer_JSu_0017853 - 56.	Hearsay	Appears to be a journal publication of some kind.
DX7411	Affidavit of Dr. Cynthia McCormick, M.D. with exhibits.	Hearsay; Unfairly Prejudicial- Prejudice Outweighs Probative Value; Fails To Meet The Requirements of FRE 702 And/Or FRE 703	

Exhibit Number	Description	Objection	Comment
DX7413	Affidavit of Alexander Ruggieri, M.D.	Hearsay	
DX7436	Janeth Turner CV.	Hearsay; Unfairly Prejudicial- Prejudice Outweighs Probative Value	
DX7449	Manfred Hauben, M.D., M.P.H., D.T.M.&H CV.	Hearsay; Unfairly Prejudicial- Prejudice Outweighs Probative Value	
DX7450	Lloyd Knapp, Pharm.D. CV.	Hearsay; Unfairly Prejudicial- Prejudice Outweighs Probative Value	
DX7453	Richard Mattson, M.D. CV.	Hearsay; Unfairly Prejudicial- Prejudice Outweighs Probative Value	
DX7454	Declaration of Richard Mattson.	Hearsay; Unfairly Prejudicial- Prejudice Outweighs Probative Value	
DX7455	Declaration of Miroslav Backonja, M.D.	Hearsay; Unfairly Prejudicial- Prejudice Outweighs Probative Value	
DX7456	Declaration of Dr. Kenneth Gorson.	Hearsay; Unfairly Prejudicial- Prejudice Outweighs Probative Value	
DX7457	Declaration of Dr. Edward Vieta.	Hearsay; Unfairly Prejudicial- Prejudice Outweighs Probative Value	
DX7458	Declaration of Robert Gerner, M.D.	Hearsay; Unfairly Prejudicial- Prejudice Outweighs Probative Value	
DX7459	Declaration of Carol A. Janney, M. S.	Hearsay; Unfairly Prejudicial- Prejudice Outweighs Probative Value	
DX7460	Declaration of Dr. Ninan T. Mathew.	Hearsay; Unfairly Prejudicial- Prejudice Outweighs Probative Value	
DX7461	Dr. Mark Mengel, M.D., M.P.H. CV.	Hearsay; Unfairly Prejudicial- Prejudice Outweighs Probative Value	
DX7462	Deposition of Benston McFarland.	Hearsay	
DX7464	Figure A, "Stimulus-Dependent Modulation of [3H] Norepinephrine Release from Rat Neocortical Slices by Gabapentin and Pregabalin," 295 J. Pharmacology and Experimental Therapeutics 1086, 1089 (2000).	Hearsay	Chart out of a journal article.
DX7471	Over-the-Counter Labeling Rule.	Relevance; Hearsay	
DX7508	Gabapentin monotherapy: II. A 26-Week, Double-Blind, Dose-Controlled, Multicenter Study of Conversion from Polytherapy in Outpatients with Refractory Complex Partial or Secondarily Generalized Seizures.	Hearsay	Journal Article
DX7566	Charles Taylor 8/27/09 Deposition Exhibit 1	Hearsay; Chart Not Provided As Part of Expert Report In Advance Of Deposition; Incomplete Document; Calls For Expert Testimony;	
DX7567	Charles Taylor 8/27/09 Deposition Exhibit 2	Hearsay; Chart Not Provided As Part of Expert Report In Advance Of Deposition; Incomplete Document; Calls For Expert Testimony;	
DX7568	Charles Taylor 8/27/09 Deposition Exhibit 3	Hearsay; Chart Not Provided As Part of Expert Report In Advance Of Deposition; Incomplete Document; Calls For Expert Testimony;	
DX7569	Charles Taylor 8/27/09 Deposition Exhibit 4	Hearsay; Chart Not Provided As Part of Expert Report In Advance Of Deposition; Incomplete Document; Calls For Expert Testimony;	

Exhibit Number	Description	Objection	Comment
DX7570	Charles Taylor 8/27/09 Deposition Exhibit 5	Hearsay; Chart Not Provided As Part of Expert Report In Advance Of Deposition; Incomplete Document; Calls For Expert Testimony;	
DX7571	Charles Taylor 8/27/09 Deposition Exhibit 6	Hearsay; Chart Not Provided As Part of Expert Report In Advance Of Deposition; Incomplete Document; Calls For Expert Testimony;	
DX7572	Charles Taylor 8/27/09 Deposition Exhibit 7	Hearsay; Chart Not Provided As Part of Expert Report In Advance Of Deposition; Incomplete Document; Calls For Expert Testimony;	
DX7573	Charles Taylor 8/27/09 Deposition Exhibit 8	Hearsay; Chart Not Provided As Part of Expert Report In Advance Of Deposition; Incomplete Document; Calls For Expert Testimony;	
DX7574	Charles Taylor 8/27/09 Deposition Exhibit 9	Hearsay; Chart Not Provided As Part of Expert Report In Advance Of Deposition; Incomplete Document; Calls For Expert Testimony;	
DX7575	Charles Taylor 8/27/09 Deposition Exhibit 10	Hearsay; Chart Not Provided As Part of Expert Report In Advance Of Deposition; Incomplete Document; Calls For Expert Testimony;	
DX7576	Charles Taylor 8/27/09 Deposition Exhibit 11	Hearsay; Chart Not Provided As Part of Expert Report In Advance Of Deposition; Incomplete Document; Calls For Expert Testimony;	
DX7577	Charles Taylor 8/27/09 Deposition Exhibit 12	Hearsay; Chart Not Provided As Part of Expert Report In Advance Of Deposition; Incomplete Document; Calls For Expert Testimony;	
DX7578	Charles Taylor 8/27/09 Deposition Exhibit 13	Hearsay; Chart Not Provided As Part of Expert Report In Advance Of Deposition; Incomplete Document; Calls For Expert Testimony;	
DX7579	Charles Taylor 8/27/09 Deposition Exhibit 14	Hearsay; Chart Not Provided As Part of Expert Report In Advance Of Deposition; Incomplete Document; Calls For Expert Testimony;	
DX7735	Document titled Promostudy Report, RE: Neurontin Merritt-Putnam Symposium, Mar. 1995	Relevance; Hearsay;	No identification as to whom is creating this document
DX7739	Letter from Tracie L. Kelley (MES) to John Knoop (PD), dated Feb. 27, 1997	Hearsay;	
DX7741	Ltr from Vervack to Aquino	Relevance; Rule 403; Hearsay	
DX7747	Press release titled "PFIZER RECEIVES FDA APPROVAL TO MARKET NEURONTIN FOR POST-HERPETIC NEURALGIA", dated May 28, 2002, bearing the bates range Pfizer_KSiegler_0004997-998	Relevance; Rule 403	
DX7754	Letter from Rober M. Sutherland M.D., Co-Director Center for Pain Medicine, Allegheny General Hospital to Carlos Gorrio, Territory Manager, Parke Davis, Northeast Customer Business Unit, re: June 4, 1995 letter from Sherwood Richardson to Anthony Wild, da	Hearsay; Unfairly Prejudicial- Prejudice Outweighs Probative Value;	

Exhibit Number	Description	Objection	Comment
DX7758	NDA 21-397 Item 6 Table of Contents - Human Pharmaockinetics and Bioavailability	Exhibit Not Provided	Exhibit Not Provided
DX7760	Proceedings of the Third International Conference on Bipolar Disorder 1999	Exhibit Not Provided	Exhibit Not Provided
DX7763	Chart Titled "Neurontin / Gabapentin Prescriptions and Promotional Expenditures" (Dec. 15, 2008, Michael C. Keeley Expert Report, p. 28)	Hearsay; Rule 403	
DX7767	Research Protocol-945-224-A Double Blind Placebo-Controlled Trial with 3 Doses of Gabapentin for Treatment of Painful Diabetic Neuropathy	Exhibit Not Provided	Exhibit Not Provided
DX7768	21 C.F.R. 314.105	Relevance; Rule 403;Foundation	Date is after death of Mr. Smith
DX7769	21 U.S.C. 301	Relevance; Rule 403;Foundation	Date is after death of Mr. Smith
DX7770	21 U.S.C. 352	Relevance; Rule 403;Foundation	Date is after death of Mr. Smith
DX7771	21 U.S.C. 355	Relevance; Rule 403;Foundation	Date is after death of Mr. Smith
DX7772	21 U.S.C. 393	Relevance; Rule 403;Foundation	Date is after death of Mr. Smith
DX7773	51 Fed. Reg. 43900	Relevance; Rule 403;Foundation	Date is after death of Mr. Smith
DX7774	71 Fed. Reg. 3922-29 (Jan. 24, 2006)	Relevance; Rule 403;Foundation	Date is after death of Mr. Smith
DX7775	21 C.F.R. 201.57 (April 2002)	Rule 403;Foundation	
DX7776	21 C.F.R. 202.1	Relevance; Rule 403;Foundation	Date is after death of Mr. Smith
DX7777	21 C.F.R. 312.20	Relevance; Rule 403;Foundation	Date is after death of Mr. Smith
DX7778	21 C.F.R. 312.22	Relevance; Rule 403;Foundation	Date is after death of Mr. Smith
DX7779	21 C.F.R. 314.50	Relevance; Rule 403;Foundation	Date is after death of Mr. Smith
DX7780	21 C.F.R. 314.80	Relevance; Rule 403;Foundation	Date is after death of Mr. Smith

Exhibit Number	Description	Objection	Comment
DX7781	Daubert Hearing Transcript (6-20-08)	Relevance; Hearsay; Unfairly Prejudicial- Prejudice Outweighs Probative Value; Rule 403;Foundation	
DX7782	Daubert Hearing Transcript(7-23-08)	Relevance; Hearsay; Unfairly Prejudicial- Prejudice Outweighs Probative Value; Rule 403;Foundation	
DX7783	Daubert Hearing Transcript (6-19-08)	Relevance; Hearsay; Unfairly Prejudicial- Prejudice Outweighs Probative Value; Rule 403;Foundation	

Journal Articles

Plaintiff objects generally to the admissibility of journal articles as inadmissible hearsay, but do not contest authenticity as the journal articles are self-authenticating under F.R.E. 902. Plaintiff does not object peer-reviewed journal articles being displayed to the jury under the learned treatise doctrine. These documents bear the exhibit numbers starting with JX (JX300-JX1195) as well as the following additional exhibit numbers:

Additional Journal Articles
DX0263
DX7407
DX7409
DX7463
DX7465
DX7466
DX7467
DX7468
DX7469
DX7470
DX7560
DX7564
DX7565

These exhibits have not been provided as the objection is the same for each and every exhibit.

Case-Specific Records

The following documents are case-specific medical records, employment records, personal records, and incident records. Plaintiff does not object to the extent that certain pages must be redacted for the Plaintiff's personal information.

Exhibit Number	Description
DX0001	Richard Smith's National Health Laboratories Medical Records.
DX0002	Richard Smith's Wood, Christopher L. DDS, Dental Records.
DX0003	Richard Smith's Berklacich, Frank M. MD, Medical Records.
DX0004	Richard Smith's Action Quick Corporation, Medical Records.
DX0005	Richard Smith's Baptist Hospital, Medical Records.
DX0006	Richard Smith's Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Tennessee, Insurance Records.
DX0007	Richard Smith's Cardiology Group of Middle Tennessee, Medical Records.
DX0008	Richard Smith's Centennial Medical Center, Medical Records.
DX0009	Richard Smith's Centers for Medicare and Medicaid Services, Insurance Records.
DX0010	Richard Smith's Colon & Rectal Surgery Associates, Medical Records.
DX0011	Richard Smith's Dyer, David N. MD, Medical Records.
DX0012	Richard Smith's Eckerd Drugs, Pharmacy Records.

Exhibit Number	Description
DX0013	Richard Smith's Hampf, Carl MD, Medical Records.
DX0014	Richard Smith's Harwell, William B., Jr. MD, Medical Records.
DX0015	Richard Smith's Heart & Vascular Clinic, Medical Records.
DX0016	Richard Smith's Heritage Medical Associates, Medical Records.
DX0017	Richard Smith's Loden Vision Center, Optometry Records.
DX0018	Richard Smith's Nashville Orthopedic Associates, Medical Records.
DX0019	Richard Smith's Neurological Surgeons, Medical Records.
DX0020	Richard Smith's Neurosurgical Associates, Medical Records.
DX0021	Richard Smith's Otolaryngology Associates of Tennessee, Medical Records.
DX0022	Richard Smith's Outpatient Diagnostic Center, Medical Records.
DX0023	Richard Smith's Premier Radiology, Medical Records
DX0024	Richard Smith's Saint Thomas Hospital, Medical Records.
DX0025	Richard Smith's Southern Sports Medicine records.
DX0026	Richard Smith's Spalding & Nesbitt Urology Clinic, Medical Records.
DX0027	Richard Smith's Specialized Assays, Medical Records.
DX0028	Richard Smith's Tennessee Orthopedic Alliance, Medical Records.
DX0029	Richard Smith's University Medical Center, Medical Records.
DX0030	Richard Smith's Vanderbilt University Medical Center, Medical Records.
DX0031	Richard Smith's Willowbrook Home Care Agencies, Medical Records.
DX0032	Richard Smith's Woods, Christopher L. DDS, Dental Records.
DX0033	Richard Smith's Plaintiff Produced Records
DX0034	Richard Smith's Associated Urologists of Nashville records.
DX0035	Richard Smith's Powers Chiropractic Clinic records.
DX0036	Richard Smith's CVS records.
DX0037	Richard Smith's Elite Sports Medicine records.
DX0038	Richard Smith's Midstate Cardiology records.
DX0039	Richard Smith's Nashville Internal Medicine Associates records.
DX0040	Richard Smith's Rite Aid records.
DX0041	Richard Smith's Schull, David, M.D. records.
DX0042	Richard Smith's Premier Orthopedics and Sports Medicine records.
DX0043	Richard Smith's Stasko, Thomas records.
DX0044	Richard Smith's Urology Associates records.
DX0045	Richard Smith's Mohs Micrographic Surgery and Dermatology records.
DX0046	Richard Smith's Walgreen's records.
DX0047	Richard Smith's McCombs, Paul, M.D. records.
DX0048	Richard Smith's Medicare records.
DX0200	Richard Smith's W-2 Forms.
DX0201	Richard Smith's Nashville Office Machines, Employment Records.
DX0202	Richard Smith's IRS Tax Return Records.
DX0203	Metropolitan Nashville Police Department, Records.
DX0204	Autopsy Records.
DX0205	Plaintiff's Response to Defendant's First Set of Interrogatories
DX0210	Letter from M. Richer to A. Seaton re: additional Information

Exhibit Number	Description
DX0211	Berklacich, Frank M.D. - Medical Records marked at deposition.
DX0212	Medical Examination Report marked at the deposition of Gary Wayne Biggs.
DX0218	Metropolitan Police Department Report by Danny Satterfield marked at the deposition of Gary Wayne Biggs.
DX0220	Medical records marked at the deposition of James Cato, M.D.
DX0223	Invoice to Richard Smith from Carl Hampf, M.D.
DX0224	Medical records marked at the deposition of Carl Hampf, M.D.
DX0225	Medical records marked at the deposition of Pamela Krancer, APN
DX0228	Medical records marked at the deposition of Feng Li, M.D., J.D., Ph.D.
DX0230	Medical records marked at the deposition of Edward Mackey, M.D.
DX0231	Medical records marked at the deposition of Paul R. McCombs, III, M.D.
DX0233	Police records marked at the deposition of Danny Satterfield
DX0235	Medical records marked at the deposition of Danny Satterfield
DX0236	Medical records marked at the deposition of Ruth Smith
DX0237	Page from Questionnaire marked at the deposition of Ruth Smith
DX0238	Pharmacy records marked at the deposition of Ruth Smith
DX0239	Pharmacy records marked at the deposition of Ruth Smith
DX0240	Medical records marked at the deposition of Ruth Smith
DX0241	Medical records marked at the deposition of Ruth Smith
DX0242	Expert from Plaintiff's Response to First Set of Interrogatories marked at the deposition of Ruth Smith
DX0243	Pharmacy records marked at the deposition of Ruth Smith
DX0244	Medical records marked at the deposition of Ruth Smith
DX0245	Medical records marked at the deposition of Cindy Smith-Charlton.
DX0246	Medical records marked at the deposition of Stewart Stowers.
DX0248	Dental records marked at the deposition of Chris L. Wood.
DX0249	Samples of Neurontin or other medications or containers in possession of the Smith family
DX0250	Photographs of Neurontin or other medications or containers in possession of the Smith Family to be taken at a future date upon agreement of the parties

Expert Reports

The parties have entered into a stipulation that compete expert reports will not be introduced into evidence. The following documents, not provided to the court, are the list of exhibits Plaintiff believes are covered by the stipulation:

Exhibit Number	Description
DX0253	Douglas Jacobs, M.D. Expert Report.
DX0254	Peter M. Donofrio, M.D. Expert Report.
DX0255	Peter M. Donofrio, M.D. CV
DX0256	Robert P. Granacher, M.D., M.B.A. Expert Report.
DX0257	Robert P. Granacher, M.D., M.B.A. CV
DX7412	Alexander Ruggieri, M.D. Expert Report.
DX7414	Alexander Ruggieri, M.D. Supplemental Expert Report.
DX7415	Alexander Ruggieri, M.D. CV.
DX7416	Charles P. Taylor, Ph.D. Expert Report.
DX7417	Charles P. Taylor, Ph.D. CV.
DX7418	Gerard Sanacora, Ph.D. M.D. Expert Report.
DX7419	Gerard Sanacora, Ph.D. M.D. Supplemental Expert Report.
DX7420	Charles P. Taylor, Ph.D. Supplemental Expert Report.
DX7421	Gerard Sanacora, Ph.D. M.D. CV.
DX7422	Janet Arrowsmith-Lowe, M.D. Expert Report.
DX7423	Janet Arrowsmith, M.D. Supplemental Expert Report.
DX7424	Janet Arrowsmith-Lowe, M.D. Expert Report.
DX7425	Janet Arrowsmith-Lowe, M.D. Supplemental Expert Report.
DX7426	Janet Arrowsmith-Lowe, M.D. CV.
DX7427	Sheila Weiss Smith, Ph.D. Expert Report.
DX7428	Sheila Weiss Smith, Ph.D. Supplemental Expert Report.
DX7429	Sheila Weiss Smith, Ph.D. CV.
DX7430	Robert D. Gibbons, Ph.D. Expert Report.
DX7431	Robert D. Gibbons, Ph.D. Supplemental Expert Report.
DX7432	Robert D. Gibbons, Ph.D. Supplemental Expert Report.
DX7433	Robert D. Gibbons, Ph.D. Supplemental Expert Report.
DX7434	Robert D. Gibbons, Ph.D. CV.
DX7435	Atul C. Pande, M.D. CV bearing the bates range Pfizer_APande_0000352 - 54.
DX7437	Gary Brenner Ph.D. CV.
DX7438	Gary Brenner Ph.D. Expert Report.

DX7439	Edward Boyer, M.D. CV.
DX7440	Edward Boyer, M.D. Expert Report.
DX7441	Anthony Rothschild, M.D. CV.
DX7442	Anthony Rothschild, M.D. Expert Report.
DX7443	Anthony Rothschild, M.D. Expert Report.
DX7444	Douglas Jacobs, M.D. CV.
DX7445	Douglas Jacobs, M.D. Expert Report.
DX7446	Douglas Jacobs, M.D. Expert Report.
DX7447	Henry Grabowski, Ph.D. CV.
DX7448	Henry Grabowski, Ph. D Expert Report.
DX7451	Bentson McFarland M.D., Ph.D. Expert Report.
DX7784	Robert D. Gibbons, Ph.D. Supplemental Expert Report.
DX7785	Robert D. Gibbons, Ph.D. Supplemental Expert Report.
DX7786	Henry Grabowski, Ph. D Supplemental Expert Report.
DX7787	Henry Grabowski, Ph. D Supplemental Expert Report.

These exhibits have not been provided as they are covered by stipulation.

Dated: May 12, 2010

Respectfully submitted,

THE LANIER LAW FIRM, P.L.L.C.

By: /s/ W. Mark Lanier
W. Mark Lanier, Esq.
Dara G. Hegar, Esq.
Ken S. Soh, Esq.
Maura Kolb, Esq.
Robert Leone, Esq.
126 East 56th Street, 6th Floor
New York, NY 10022

- and -

FINKELSTEIN & PARTNERS, LLP

By: /s/ Andrew G. Finkelstein
Andrew G. Finkelstein, Esq.
Kenneth B. Fromson, Esq.
1279 Route 300, P.O. Box 1111
Newburgh, NY 12551

- and -

BARRETT & ASSOCIATES, P.A.

By: /s/ Charles F. Barrett
Charles F. Barrett, Esq.
BPR # 020627
6518 Highway 100, Suite 210
Nashville, TN 37205

Attorneys for Plaintiff Ruth Smith

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on this the 12th day of May, 2010, I electronically filed the foregoing document with the Clerk of the Court, United States District Court for the Middle District of Tennessee, using the CM/ECF system. True and correct copies of the foregoing documents are being served via the Court's CM/ECF system on the following:

Aubrey B. Harwell, Jr., Esq.
W. David Bridgers, Esq.
Gerald D. Neenan, Esq.
Robert A. Peal, Esq.
Neal & Harwell, PLC
2000 One Nashville Place
150 Fourth Avenue, North
Nashville, TN 37219

Prince C. Chambliss, Jr., Esq.
Evans & Petree, PC
1000 Ridgeway Loop Road, Suite 200
Memphis, TN 38120

Mark S. Cheffo, Esq.
Catherine B. Stevens, Esq.
Skadden, Arps, Slate, Meagher & Flom LLP
Four Times Square
New York, NY 10036

Andrew Howell Myers, Esq.
James Ernest Hooper, Esq.
Stephen Ernest Oertle, Esq.
Wheeler Trigg O'Donnell LLP
1801 California Street, Suite 3600
Denver, CO 80202-2617

Faith E. Gay, Esq.
Quinn, Emanuel, Urquhart, Oliver & Hedges, LLP
51 Madison Avenue, 22nd Floor
New York, NY 10010

/s/ Andrew G. Finkelstein

Andrew G. Finkelstein